

**REGULAR MEETING  
CITIZENS' FLOOD ZONE COMMITTEE  
WEDNESDAY, MARCH 9, 2016, 6:30 P.M.**

**CITY HALL COUNCIL CHAMBERS  
450 SAN RAFAEL AVENUE  
BELVEDERE, CALIFORNIA**

**AGENDA**

<b>OPEN FORUM</b>
-------------------

*This is an opportunity for any citizen to briefly address the Committee on any matter that does not appear on this agenda. Upon being recognized by the Chair, please state your name, address, and limit your oral statement to no more than three minutes. Matters that appear to warrant a more lengthy presentation or Committee consideration will be agendaized for further discussion at a later meeting.*

<b>SCHEDULED ITEMS</b>
------------------------

1. Approve minutes of the December 17, 2015, meeting of the Citizens' Flood Zone Committee
  
2. Update on Department of Water Resources grants and meeting with FEMA personnel; Discussion re: next steps.

**ADJOURN**

<b>NOTICE: WHERE TO VIEW AGENDA MATERIALS</b>
---

Staff reports and other writings distributed to the Committee, including those distributed after the posting date of this agenda, are available for public inspection at Belvedere City Hall, 450 San Rafael Avenue, Belvedere. To request automatic mailing of agenda materials, please contact the City Clerk at 415-435-8908.
--

<b>NOTICE: AMERICANS WITH DISABILITIES ACT</b>
--

The following accommodations will be provided, upon request, to persons with a disability: agendas and/or agenda packet materials in alternate formats and special assistance needed to attend or participate in this meeting. Please make your request at the Office of the City Clerk or by calling 415/435-8908. Whenever possible, please make your request four working days in advance.
---

**CITIZENS' FLOOD ZONE COMMITTEE  
THURSDAY, DECEMBER 17, 2015, 6:30 P.M.  
COUNCIL CHAMBERS  
450 SAN RAFAEL AVENUE, BELVEDERE, CA**

**MINUTES**

---

**COMMITTEE PRESENT:** Andrew Allen, Glenn Isaacson, Ken Johnson, John Parsons, David Rhoades, Marty Winter, and Chair Thomas Cromwell

**COMMITTEE ABSENT:** Jim Allen, Stewart Bewley, Robert Huret, Bob McCaskill, James Robertson, Bruce Sams, Walter Strycker, and Connie Wiley

**OTHERS PRESENT:** Building Official Eric Banvard, City Clerk Alison Foulis, Stetson Engineer James Reilly, and City Manager Mary Neilan

**CALL TO ORDER OF REGULAR MEETING**

The meeting was called to order at 6:40 PM.

**OPEN FORUM**

No one wished to speak.

Chair Cromwell provided an overview of the history of the City's appeal of the FEMA map designations and the grants received from the Department of Water Resources.

**SCHEDULED ITEMS**

**1. Approve minutes of the February 11, 2015, meeting of the Citizens' Flood Zone Committee**

Minutes were approved as presented.

**2. Review of Department of Water Resources (DWR) grants scope of work, budget and schedule; recommend next steps**

City Manager Neilan introduced the item and stated that this meeting was intended to gauge the interest level of the committee in pursuing the grants. Stetson Engineer James Reilly

explained that the final list of grant awardees will be published in February or March, 2016, followed by a negotiation period with DWR to be concluded around June or July 2016. Stetson Engineer Reilly provided an overview of the first grant, the Belvedere Lagoon Coastal Levee System Evaluation, including the cost and estimated timeline. The cost is estimated at \$1,112,550, with 55% (\$611,902) covered by the grant and 45% (\$500,648) the responsibility of the City. The Committee discussed the scope of work, how to include bail out points if it becomes evident that the project will cost more than the benefit it will provide, and the Conditional Letter of Map Revision (CLOMR) process with FEMA.

Chair Cromwell called for public comment.

William Rothman asked the Committee questions about the allocation of city funds, the overtopping analysis, and the new zoning height regulations.

Stetson Engineer Reilly provided an overview of the West Shore Levee Geotechnical evaluation, which would map the size, extent and physical nature of the revetments along West Shore Road. The total cost of this project, \$208,700, would be split equally by the grant and the City. Stetson Engineer Reilly explained that the study of the revetment and CLOMRs could be done on a parcel-by-parcel basis.

Chair Cromwell again called for public comment.

William Rothman asked about the effect of holes in the revetment if West Shore Road was studied on a parcel-by-parcel basis.

Stetson Engineer Reilly shared with the Committee concept drawings of the height changes that may be necessary at the Beach Road and San Rafael Avenue levees. He estimated that the Beach Road levee would need to be raised to 10.7 ft. NAVD, where it is currently 8 to 9 feet, and the San Rafael Avenue levee would need to be raised to 10 ft. NAVD where it is currently 8 to 9 feet.

Committee Member Johnson made a motion that the City Council consider the information presented tonight as soon as possible, given the pending status of the grants, and recommends that the Council consider all positive aspects of the potential studies as a benefit to all Belvedere citizens. The Committee discussed Committee Member's Johnsons motion.

Chair Cromwell called for public comment.

William Rothman asked questions about the spending of public funds.

Committee Member Allen seconded the motion of Committee Member Johnson, and the Committee agreed unanimously.

City Manager Neilan discussed the Committee's meeting schedule for the coming year.

**Adjourn**

The meeting was adjourned at 8:04 PM.

**THE FOREGOING MINUTES** were approved at a regular meeting of the Citizens' Flood Zone Committee on \_\_\_\_\_ by the following vote:

**AYES:**

**NOES:**

**ABSENT:**

**ABSTAIN:**

**APPROVED:** \_\_\_\_\_  
Thomas Cromwell, Chair

**ATTEST:** \_\_\_\_\_  
Mary Neilan, City Manager



---

# CITY OF BELVEDERE

## Memorandum

---

March 4, 2016

**TO:** Citizens Flood Zone Committee

**FROM:** Mary Neilan, City Manager

**SUBJECT:** Status report on DWR grant (Belvedere Lagoon Coastal Levee Evaluation) and meeting with FEMA personnel; Discussion re: Next Steps

---

In December, the CFZC met to discuss the award of the Dept. of Water Resources Local Levee Assistance Program grant and the workplan it is intended to fund. At that meeting the CFZC recommended that the City Council “consider the positive aspects of the potential studies as a benefit to all Belvedere citizens” when deciding whether to accept the grant and allocate the required matching funds.

In anticipation of the publication of a final list of awardees (supposed to occur in “early 2016” per the DWR website), James Reilly and I met recently with FEMA Region 9 personnel, to confirm that the advice received from FEMA last year regarding our approach to the levee evaluation had not changed.

That meeting took place on February 23 at the offices of AECOM (civil engineering consultant for FEMA) in Oakland. In attendance were Region 9 Civil Engineers Shilpa Mulik and Ed Curtis, FEMA Risk Analysis Branch Chief Juliette Hayes, FEMA Natural Hazards Program Specialist Michael Hornick and AECOM Coastal Engineer Kris May. James Reilly reviewed the grant workplan to conduct a feasibility study of potential modifications to the embankments along San Rafael Ave. and Beach Rd. and reiterated the City’s goal of amending the Flood Insurance Rate Map (FIRM), specifically lowering the Base Flood Elevation (BFE) and removing Belvedere properties around the Lagoon from Flood Zone AE.

When we met with this same group in early 2015 (minus Kris May), we were told that FEMA could not provide much preliminary guidance to clarify their numerous and often conflicting regulations regarding levee evaluation and how they apply to the specific situation that exists in Belvedere. At that time, they advised that we proceed with the feasibility study and propose a project by submitting a Conditional Letter of Map Revision (CLOMR) that would then be evaluated by FEMA personnel pursuant to their regulatory framework. That is what the LLAP grant workplan proposes to do.

However, when we met with them three weeks ago, there were several concerns expressed and issues raised that, if not resolved, may severely limit the City’s ability to amend the FIRM and remove properties from the AE zone.

## Characterization of the structures

If the City characterizes Beach Rd. and San Rafael Ave. as “non-levee embankments”, as we were advised to do by FEMA in late 2014, then FEMA guidance (Procedure Memorandum 51, 2/27/09) dictates that the embankments would provide no barrier effect against coastal flooding; that is, the interior lagoon area would be flood mapped assuming total failure of the embankments during the 1% annual chance coastal flood (i.e., as if the embankments did not exist). This is the approach FEMA has taken to date and is reflected in the current FIRM and new FIRM which will become effective March 16, 2016. No partial credit can be granted to non-levee embankments.

If the City characterizes the Beach Rd. and San Rafael Ave. structures as “levees,” the City must demonstrate to FEMA that they meet the following criteria: the levees must be (a) designed for flood protection; (b) operated as a “levee,” and (c) operated and maintained by a public entity.

In this case, the levee *system* is what FEMA would evaluate: not only the roads, but the lagoon, the pumps and the drainage system used to manage the water level. FEMA would want to see the City or some other public entity assume complete responsibility for the *system* and would require that an approved Operations and Maintenance plan be in place.

FEMA’s rules also require levees to be free of encroachments that could affect their structural stability. After conducting a site visit on March 1, FEMA made the following observations regarding encroachments and other deficiencies in the levees.

### San Rafael Avenue

1. Vegetation including mature trees located on the crest of the embankment (most notably at the north tie-in to Tiburon Boulevard) whose root structures may compromise the structural integrity of the embankment.
2. A large intake/outlet structure for the lagoon pumping system that may compromise the structural integrity of the embankment.
3. Residential structures that encroach the seaward side of the embankment, most notably at the southern tie-in point approximately 500 feet south of the San Rafael Avenue/West Shore Road intersection
4. Close proximity of residential structures on both the seaward and lagoonward sides of the embankment that potentially interfere with regular inspection and maintenance of the embankment.

### Beach Road

1. Upper portion of the concrete seawall has openings that require coverings (e.g., flap gates) if the upper portion of the seawall is considered to be part of the flood control structure.
2. Upper portion of the concrete seawall is not continuous; it stops and starts again on either side of a house built on pilings on the seaward side of the seawall.
3. Upper portion of the concrete seawall has visible cracks.

4. Lower portion of the concrete seawall along Main Street near the southern tie-in point is undermined.
5. Close proximity of residential structures on both the seaward and lagoonward sides of the seawall and road embankment that potentially interfere with regular inspection and maintenance of the embankment, most notably at the northern tie-in to Acacia Avenue.

While some of these deficiencies may be able to be mitigated (removal of trees, for example), there are others that cannot (such as the structures that exist at San Rafael/West Shore Rd and on Beach Rd.).

### **What if?**

If these issues were somehow resolved and FEMA allowed Beach Rd and San Rafael Ave to be characterized as “levees,” then there are two paths to obtain FEMA recognition of a total or partial barrier effect and re-map the flood risk of the interior lagoon area:

- 1) By gaining FEMA’s “accreditation” of the levees
  - a) Procedures for levee accreditation are set forth in NFIP Regulations Sec. 65.10
    - (1) Levee accreditation in accordance with Sec. 65.10 would require that the levees provide a total barrier effect; that is, they must be raised to elevations sufficient to prevent overtopping from the 1% annual chance still water (el. 10 ft NAVD), plus the maximum wave height/run-up, plus 1 ft of freeboard. This would likely require raising Beach Rd and San Rafael Ave by 4 ft or higher. In addition to the height requirements, all of the other requirements as per 44 CFR 65.10 would have to be met to qualify for levee accreditation (e.g., public entity responsibility, operations and maintenance plans, etc.).
- 2) Through revised flood mapping following FEMA’s new Levee Analysis and Mapping Procedures (LAMP) for “non-accredited levees.”
  - a) FEMA’s allowable applicability of LAMP to Beach Rd and San Rafael Ave is uncertain because LAMP was designed to apply to “levees” as they exist; not to “levees” as they are proposed to be modified. Before the LAMP process could be initiated, FEMA would first need to make the determination that LAMP could be applied to Beach Rd and San Rafael Ave “levees” as they are proposed to be modified.
    - (1) If FEMA makes the determination that LAMP could be applied to Beach Rd and San Rafael Ave, then FEMA would create a Local Levee Partnership Team (LLPT), composed of “stakeholders,” to guide the LAMP process. The LLPT would likely include FEMA, City of Belvedere, BLPOA, and possibly Town of Tiburon.
    - (2) Under the guidance of the LLPT, the City would undertake the technical studies to justify re-mapping the flood risk of the interior lagoon area. These studies would need to include geotechnical and structural evaluations of the stability of the levees, hydraulic analysis of overtopping the levees and flooding, and operations and maintenance plans, all certified by an engineer. These studies are included in the scope of the City’s DWR LLAP grant project.
    - (3) The end product of the LAMP would be the LLPT’s submittal to FEMA of a request to re-map the flood risk in the interior lagoon flood zone along with supporting technical justification, all of which are included in the scope of the City’s DWR LLAP grant project.

## **Flood Zone D and Flood Zone AE**

And yet, even if FEMA acknowledged that our “non-accredited levees” mitigated flood risk in the lagoon, they would likely designate the parcels around the lagoon as Zone D, which is referred to as an “uncertain” flood risk zone. Although not required by federal regulators, some lenders nonetheless require mortgage holders in Zone D to carry flood insurance.

Even with the remapping, lenders may still consider some residential structures in the lagoon to be located in Zone AE. The reason is that the lagoon itself (i.e., the open water area) would still be mapped Zone AE -- albeit at a lower BFE (projected to be approx. el. 5 ft NAVD) – with only the higher shoreline areas mapped out of Zone AE. And, if any part of a residential structure (i.e., any part that’s structurally connected to the residential structure) is determined to touch the lagoon, then the entire residential structure is considered to be in Zone AE. For example, if a residential structure is structurally connected to an outside deck which is structurally connected to a dock or bulkhead which touches the lagoon, then the entire residential structure (i.e., residence, deck, and dock/bulkhead) would be considered in Zone AE. In order for the residential structure to be mapped out of Zone AE, an Elevation Certificate would be required certifying that the “lowest adjacent grade” along the perimeter of the structure’s foundation, including any deck and dock/bulkhead that are structurally connected to the structure or its foundation, is at or above the BFE for the Zone AE (i.e., higher than el. 5 ft, again which is the projected future BFE with the future “levee” modifications in place).

## **Conclusion**

Given current conditions on San Rafael Ave and Beach Rd, and FEMA’s existing regulatory framework, there is not a path for the City to seek “credit” for the levee system that protects Belvedere properties from flood risk and seek to amend the FIRM.

There remains, however, an opportunity to use the LLAP grant to help fund necessary improvements to that system and enhance flood protection in Belvedere, even if those improvements do not change the flood zone designation.

## **Next Steps**

At this juncture, it seems appropriate to direct the City’s consultant to amend the workplan for the LLAP grant to focus on levee system improvements and eliminate the tasks related to flood map revision.

Staff welcomes CFZC comments on this approach, or any other course of action.