

Alison Foulis - City Clerk

From: Mary Neilan - City Manager
Sent: Sunday, June 12, 2016 8:51 AM
To: Alison Foulis - City Clerk
Subject: Fwd: Wet winter raises concerns over tick proliferation

Late mail

Begin forwarded message:

From: John Owen
Date: June 11, 2016 at 9:25:32 PM PDT
To: Mary Neilan - City Manager <mneilan@cityofbelvedere.org>
Subject: **Wet winter raises concerns over tick proliferation**

Dear Mary

I understand you will be preparing various material for an informational packet to be distributed ahead of the Council meeting on Monday June 13.

As Lyme disease is likely to become a topic for discussion during the Deer Committee agenda item I thought you might like to consider including in the packet this article from the IJ that appeared recently.

It is well researched and very relevant to the discussion.

With many thanks for your consideration.

John Owen

<http://www.marinij.com/health/20160409/marins-wet-winter-raises-concerns-over-tick-proliferation>

Marin's wet winter raises concerns over tick proliferation

Wet winter cited as risk factor for proliferation

By Adrian Rodriguez, *Marin Independent Journal*

Saturday, April 9, 2016



Marla Orth of Corte Madera has been bitten three times by ticks while clearing brush in the Alto Bowl Open Space Preserve in Mill Valley, where she has been a steward for 25 years. The third incident, about 14 years ago, is when she suspects she contracted Lyme disease.

“No one knows for sure how long I’ve had it,” said Orth, who saw about 15 specialists over 11 years before she was diagnosed in 2013. She suffers from severe neuropathic pain, joint pain and fatigue daily.

“I just kept getting sicker and sicker,” she said. “I had been telling the doctors that

something is not right.”

Marin already is a hot spot for ticks and tick-borne illnesses such as Lyme disease, and this year, after a soggy winter, the threat could be worse, some specialists say.

“Ticks thrive in moisture,” said Linda Giampa, executive director of the Bay Area Lyme Foundation, a Palo Alto-based nonprofit. “A lot more ticks are expected to be out this season than there have been in the last few years of the drought.”

Tick season in California is year round. Adult ticks, active from fall through early spring, are abundant in the winter, Giampa said.

Their eggs have hatched and already “the nymphs are coming out in droves,” she said.

The young nymphs are most problematic, because they are tiny and hard to see, Giampa said.

Generally, ticks are found in grassy, brushy or wooded areas, especially around trails. They wait on blades of grass or tips of any vegetation for a person or other animal to pass. Once on a host, the tick will find a place to attach to the skin. They feed on blood to survive.

A tick has to be attached for about 36 hours to transmit the Lyme bacteria, so the longer the tick stays embedded the higher the risk of disease transmission. Ticks can stay attached for many hours or several days.

Ticks on trails

Belinda Evans, a veterinarian at the Marin Humane Society, said she suspects there will be slightly more vegetation because of the rainy months this year, giving ticks more opportunity to seek hosts in the stray or untreated animals that roam through tall grass.

“It’s important to get ticks off of animals, and having your pets on a flea and tick repellent is best practice” she said. Evans also recommended that pet owners use repellent sprays when on hikes or in woody areas.

Whenever going into open space, “be aware,” said David Herlocker, an interpretive naturalist at Marin County Parks. “There are

always going to be ticks out there.”

He said, “People should avoid brushing up on the side of the trail, don’t walk off trail and always check yourself and your dog.”

Furthermore, he said, “ticks are easier to spot if you’re wearing light color clothing.”

Some residents said ticks have been a real nuisance this year.

Liz McCarthy said her dog Tica can’t go outside their Marinwood home without attracting hordes of ticks.

“She tends to chase animals and she runs out to the backyard, which is attached to open space,” she said. “Within minutes, I look and she is covered. Once I got 21 ticks off of her. ... It was so gross.”

‘Prevention is key’

In 2015, the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention reported that there are about 300,000 new cases of Lyme disease each year. In California, infected ticks are found in 42 of the 58 counties, the main culprit being the Western black-legged tick, or *Ixodes pacificus*. Its principal host is the gray squirrel.

Angie Nakan, special programs director of the Marin/Sonoma Mosquito and Vector Control District, said the district’s lab conducts tick surveillance and disease testing in various areas within Marin, including China Camp, Mount Tamalpais and Marin Municipal Water District lands. Samples are collected by dragging a white felt cloth against vegetation along trails. The ticks attach themselves to the material and are transferred to vials.

In a 2012 study, about 2.3 percent of adult ticks and 3.9 percent of nymphs collected in Marin were infected with the bacterium that causes Lyme disease. On average, about 3 to 5 percent of ticks gathered in Marin are infected, according to the district.

“The risk is not quite as high as in the East Coast, where they see can 50 to 90 percent of ticks being infected,” Nakan said. Nonetheless, she said, “prevention is key.”

It’s a message that resonates with Orth, whose 10-year-old Labrador Ginger has also been infected by a tick bite. Her pet has responded to antibiotics, but Orth, because she had been undiagnosed and untreated for 11 years, hasn’t been so lucky.

Orth said many insurance companies do not cover medical costs for chronic Lyme disease patients. She said with the unrelenting disease doctor’s visits add up. “People could easily spend thousands of dollars a week,” she said.

“If I could save one person from having to endure what I have,” she said, “then it is worth it to me, to let the community know that I am a chronic Lyme’s sufferer.”

URL: <http://www.marinij.com/health/20160409/marins-wet-winter-raises-concerns-over-tick-proliferation>

© 2016 Marin Independent Journal (<http://www.marinij.com>)

Alison Foulis - City Clerk

From: Mary Neilan - City Manager
Sent: Sunday, June 12, 2016 2:05 PM
To: Alison Foulis - City Clerk
Subject: Fwd: Deer Sterilization

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Dexter A Roberts"
Date: June 12, 2016 at 12:45:15 PM PDT
To: <mneilan@cityofbelvedere.org>
Subject: Deer Sterilization

Mary Neilan, Belvedere City Manager
Belvedere Council Members

Relative to the agenda item on the above subject at the City Council Meeting scheduled for June 13, 2016, I would like to express my support for the efforts of the concerned citizens who have been researching options for addressing the issue of controlling the deer population. This has been a problem that continues to become more serious as our landscape reflects the impact of denuded roadside and residential planted areas, especially on the Island. There has also been a proliferation of unattractive fences, many of which I suspect has not been approved by Planning but put in place to protect landscape investments. If there are better alternative approaches, let's hear them, but the status quo of doing nothing is unacceptable.

Sincerely,

Dexter Roberts
10 Eucalyptus Road
Belvedere

Alison Foulis - City Clerk

From: Mary Neilan - City Manager
Sent: Sunday, June 12, 2016 4:45 PM
To: Alison Foulis - City Clerk
Subject: FW: Please attend the City Council Meeting Monday evening to support the deer project

From: Cam Baker
Date: Sunday, June 12, 2016 at 4:21 PM
To: Mary Neilan <mneilan@cityofbelvedere.org>
Cc: Claire McAuliffe, John and Dawn Owen, Kate Baker, Frank Greene
Subject: RE: Please attend the City Council Meeting Monday evening to support the deer project

I'll be at Warriors game...Kate can you attend?

Council Members ...having been plagued by the many deer on our property including bucks and chased for years and we and our neighbors having put up fences and deer fences we are still plagued and respectfully request the Council take action now and implement the proposal put forth by Marshall Turner and the Committee. We definitely support it, long overdue and many thx for your consideration.

CAM BAKER

Alison Foulis - City Clerk

From: Mary Neilan - City Manager
Sent: Sunday, June 12, 2016 5:47 PM
To: Alison Foulis - City Clerk
Subject: Fwd: Deer in Belvedere

Begin forwarded message:

From: robert falltrick
Date: June 12, 2016 at 5:31:35 PM PDT
To: mneilan@cityofbelvedere.org
Subject: Deer in Belvedere

Members of the Belvedere City Council:

I appreciate the opportunity to comment on the agenda item regarding the proposal to reduce the deer population in Belvedere. We strongly support the efforts of the ad hoc committee to achieve this goal.

Contrary to the assertions from the Marin Humane society as printed in the Ark, people who have lived here a while know that the deer population has grown rapidly in the last years. My wife and I have lived in our home on Bella Vista for 30 years, and my wife grew up here so that we, like many others, can state that prior to the last 10 years there was no problem with deer depredations on Belvedere island. Our property, which was only protected by hedges in the past, is now surrounded by fencing. At this level of population the deer represent (1) a health hazard due to ticks and potential Lyme disease (2) safety issues for pets and humans. We have personally witnessed children distressed because they could not get home due to aggressive deer on the roadways. Pets have been hurt and killed. (3) Danger of erosion from foraging the protective natural landscape (4) Property damage from foraging on landscaped areas.

Efforts such as the one proposed should have been enacted years ago. I would have thought that the City and its representatives would have felt some responsibility for the welfare of its voters and done something about this problem. Let's get started.

Sincerely,

Bob and Anne Falltrick
12 Bella Vista

Alison Foulis - City Clerk

From: Mary Neilan - City Manager
Sent: Monday, June 13, 2016 8:17 AM
To: Alison Foulis - City Clerk
Subject: Fwd: Deer Sterilization Proposal

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Hansen, John T."
Date: June 12, 2016 at 2:55:03 PM PDT
To: "mneilan@cityofbelvedere.org" <mneilan@cityofbelvedere.org>
Subject: Deer Sterilization Proposal

Dear Ms. Neilan: I will be unable to attend the June 13 City Council meeting due to a scheduling conflict. However, I have studied the agenda packet for the meeting that appears on the City's website. My thoughts with respect to the deer sterilization proposal--as set forth in the agenda packet--are stated below, and I ask that you please include this email in the additional materials to be provided to each Council Member for the June 13 meeting.

I have lived at 108 Golden Gate Avenue since 1974. Over the past 42 years, I have jogged and walked the streets and stairs of Belvedere Island on a continuous basis. Based on my near daily observations over four decades, I can state without qualification or reservation that--notwithstanding the "opinion" of the Marin Humane Society--the deer herd on the Island has increased significantly in size over the years, and at an increasing rate over the past decade or so. Today, when I walk in the late afternoons/early evenings, or in the early mornings, I routinely encounter anywhere from a half dozen to ten or more deer--usually grazing on someone's property. It never used to be like this on the Island. Moreover, the deer exhibit little fear because they are so used to humans. I have on numerous occasions driven right up next to them in my car, but they continue grazing as though I am not even there. I have also encountered bucks in the middle of the street during my walks, and on occasion have retreated because they simply won't move. In this regard, I have spoken to several Belvedere women who have encountered bucks while walking their dogs. Often they feel they have no choice but to retreat. In one instance, a woman and her dog had to jump into a UPS truck that was making a delivery because the woman felt threatened. Clearly not a good situation.

On at least three occasions in the past year, I was driving on the Island at night or in the early morning and had to slam on the brakes and swerve to avoid hitting a deer that came "out of nowhere" and raced across the street in front of my car. Clearly not a safe situation.

Our home has a large garden that adds to the value of our property. To protect the garden from the deer, we have tried everything--from planting supposedly deer-resistant plants, to installing flashing lights and noisemakers, to continuously spraying with anti-deer chemicals, to building deer fencing--and nothing has proven to be completely successful. Even today, we find evidence that deer have come into our driveway and have poked their mouths through the tiny gaps in our mesh deer fence to eat our roses, while at the same time standing on and crushing the boxwood hedge that runs along the base of the deer fence. We estimate that, to date, we have spent in excess of \$25,000 trying to fend off the deer, and we continue to spend money on sprays, fence

repairs and plant replacements.

In light of the foregoing, I strongly endorse the staff recommendation that the Council authorize White Buffalo, Inc. to submit the appropriate applications to the California Department of Fish and Wildlife and that the Council schedule a special meeting on July 27 so that Dr. Anthony DeNicola of White Buffalo, Inc. can make a presentation and, in the process, respond to questions that Belvedere residents and Council Members may have.

Thank you very much for your consideration of my views.

John Hansen

Sent from my iPad

The contents of this message, together with any attachments, are intended only for the use of the individual or entity to which they are addressed and may contain information that is legally privileged, confidential and exempt from disclosure. If you are not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution, or copying of this message, or any attachment, is strictly prohibited. If you have received this message in error, please notify the original sender or the Pillsbury Winthrop Shaw Pittman Help Desk at Tel: 800-477-0770, Option 1, immediately by telephone or by return E-mail and delete this message, along with any attachments, from your computer. Thank you.

RECEIVED

JUNE 12, 2016

JUN 13 2016

City of Belvedere

BELVEDERE CITY COUNCIL

I'VE LIVED IN BELVEDERE FOR OVER FIFTY YEARS AND THERE WERE NO DEER HERE UNTIL ABOUT 20 YEARS AGO. LAST YEAR I HAD A HERD OF FIVE IN MY YARD, ALMOST WEEKLY. I KNOW OF THE ADDITION OF AT LEAST TWO NEW BABIES AND THREE TEENAGERS THIS YEAR. WITH NO NATURAL PREDATORS THEY WILL JUST CONTINUE TO MULTIPLY.

MY LANDSCAPING IS COMPLETELY DESTROYED, AND THE LOCATION OF MY DRIVEWAY MAKES IT IMPOSSIBLE TO FENCE MY YARD. ALSO DO WE WANT OUR CITY LOOKING LIKE A WALLED FORTRESS? I'VE USED GALLONS OF LIQUID FENCE WHICH HAS LITTLE EFFECT.

WE NEUTER OUR BELOVED PETS SO WHY DO PEOPLE CONSIDER IT INHUMANE TO STERILIZE WILD DEER?

SOMETHING NEEDS TO BE DONE. I FOR ONE FEEL LIKE I'M UNDER CONSTANT ASSAULT. I HOPE YOU WILL CONSIDER THE 2016 DEER GROUPS SOLUTION.

SINCERELY,

Susan S. Jones
95 BAY VIEW AVE.
BELVEDERE, CA. 94920

RECEIVED

JUN 13 2016

City of Belvedere

MARIN VOICE

Belvedere deer strategy would be safe and humane

By Frank Greene,
Marshall Turner,
Wyman Harris,
John Owen
and Carolyn Hansen

Local animal rights groups in a June 3 Marin Voice column criticized a volunteer group in Belvedere for proposing new, non-lethal approaches to managing the city's deer population. The local agencies stated that "the population of deer in Belvedere has remained the same size for many years."

Local residents would strongly disagree and doubt that these opinions are based on first-hand experience. Many Belvedere residents are in constant contact with the deer, driving and walking on our

streets and lanes. We see them stripping the vegetation along the sides of the street and carving out trails, up and down our hillsides. There are frequent near-hits and occasional fatalities with automobiles.

Some residents feel threatened on their walks; some pets have been attacked.

With abundant foliage and no predators, the deer population expands steadily. In 2009 a volunteer group looked into ways of containing the population. They concluded that the city's only recourse was to "build fences and plant deer-resistant vegetation." Fences were built and "resistant" vegetation was planted. With drought conditions, growing herds and

fenced-in gardens, the deer have had little choice but to eat whatever they can find — including "resistant" plants.

Last December, a volunteer group began to investigate changes in non-lethal deer management.

One of our early references was to the Humane Society of the United States, the largest animal protection organization in the U.S. The HSUS supports a non-lethal surgical sterilization program in Fairfax, Virginia to "humanely reduce the population of deer."

Our research also led us to the leading contractor, White Buffalo Inc., of Hamden, Connecticut. Issues of dart-tranquilizing, access to private property and sanitary surgical con-

ditions have been studied, monitored and approved by HSUS, the Animal Welfare Institute and Humane Deer Management.

Performed in a state-of-the-art, portable veterinary hospital under sanitary conditions, the sterilization procedure has been used by 14 professional veterinarians, and authorized by six state wildlife agencies including California's.

If approved by the city of Belvedere, a California-licensed veterinarian who specializes in wildlife would perform the surgeries. He has performed more than 400 ovariectomies on wild deer. Capture-related mortality rates have been less than 2 percent.

In a recent identical program at The Villages in San

Jose, approved and monitored by the state Department of Fish and Wildlife, there were no fatalities.

Our studies suggest that sterilized does experience less wear and tear from having young and thus lead longer and healthier lives than fertile females.

Deer ticks were not thought a factor for Lyme disease exposure in 2009. They are now.

According to University of California, Berkeley professor Robert Lane, the adult western black-legged tick is hosted on Northern California deer and is the primary carrier of Lyme disease bacteria to people in the Far West.

According to Professor Lane, the risk of Lyme-carrying bacteria grows with herd size. Our research

suggest that the incidence of Lyme disease in our area is on the rise.

The city of Belvedere will proceed with its own "due diligence." The state will be fully involved.

As with the San Jose project, the state would issue a permit, be present during the work, monitor the results and advise on further action if any.

Our concern is not with deer, per se; it is with their numbers and serious, possible health issues.

If successful, the proposed program would reduce the current population by about 50 percent over a period of five years.

Authors are members of a Belvedere residents' group that has formed to address the deer population.