

RECUSED: None
ABSENT: Jim Lynch

1. Draft **Minutes of the January 21, 2020** regular meeting of the Planning Commission.
2. Approval of final Resolution for denying in part an appeal of the Construction Time Limit Extension Committee's decision to deny a request for a Construction Time Limit Extension for **56 Peninsula Road**. Applicant/Property Owner: Denise Ivory.

C. PUBLIC HEARINGS

3. Demolition, Design Review and Exception to Floor Area to exceed the allowable floor area to demolish the existing single family residence and to construct a new residence and garage, pool house and pool and other associated site improvements for the subject property located at **1 Blanding Lane** (corner of Blanding Lane and Belvedere Avenue). A Revocable License is required for improvements in the City right-of-way. Property Owner: Chris Henry. Applicant: David Kotzebue (architect).

Director Irene Borba presented the staff report. A slide show presentation accompanied her remarks.¹ Late mail received after the issuance of the staff reports had been provided to the Commissioners on the dais.

David Kotzebue, applicant, presented the revised project. A slideshow presentation accompanied his remarks.²

Commissioners asked whether it would be possible to have additional mitigations to reduce cut and fill, alternatives to reduce the amount of glazing, and more details about tree removals. Mr. Kotzebue responded with clarifications.

Open public hearing.

No one wished to speak.

Close public hearing.

Commissioners discussed the project. They were in agreement that the revisions have greatly improved the project and resulted in a significant reduction of the amount of mass and bulk. There was consensus that some reduction in the amount of glazing is needed. They agreed to the removal of two additional pine trees, relocation or screening of the pool equipment to mitigate impacts on neighbors, and the addition of a screened garbage area. Added trees to screen the pool area and the window facing the pool were requested and can be considered in the final landscape plan. Commissioners agreed that they can make the findings for the Exception to Total Floor Area and all other requests.

MOTION To adopt the Resolution granting No Historical or Tribal Cultural Resource per CEQA at **1 Blanding Lane**.

MOVED BY: Marsha Lasky, seconded by Pat Carapiet.

VOTE: AYES: Peter Mark, Larry Stoehr, Marsha Lasky, Nena Hart, Pat Carapiet
Claire Slaymaker.
NOES: None
ABSTAIN: None

¹ The slide show presentation is archived with the record of the meeting.

² The applicants slide show presentation is archived with the record of the meeting.

RECUSED: None
ABSENT: Jim Lynch

MOTION: To adopt the Resolution granting demolition of the existing single-family residence in order to construct a new residence located at **1 Blanding Lane**.

MOVED BY: Marsha Lasky, seconded by Pat Carapiet.

VOTE: AYES: Peter Mark, Larry Stoehr, Marsha Lasky, Nena Hart, Pat Carapiet, Claire Slaymaker.

NOES: None
ABSTAIN: None
RECUSED: None
ABSENT: Jim Lynch

MOTION: To adopt the Resolution granting Design Review, as conditioned per the discussion tonight, for the property located at **1 Blanding Lane**.

MOVED BY: Marsha Lasky, seconded by Pat Carapiet.

VOTE: AYES: Peter Mark, Larry Stoehr, Marsha Lasky, Nena Hart, Pat Carapiet, Claire Slaymaker.

NOES: None
ABSTAIN: None
RECUSED: None
ABSENT: Jim Lynch

MOTION: To adopt the Resolution granting Exception to Total Floor Area approval to allow a total floor area of 5,382 SF, where 4,850 SF is permitted at **1 Blanding Lane**.

VOTE: AYES: Peter Mark, Larry Stoehr, Marsha Lasky, Nena Hart, Pat Carapiet, Claire Slaymaker.

NOES: None
ABSTAIN: None
RECUSED: None
ABSENT: Jim Lynch

MOTION: To recommend City Council approval of a Revocable License for improvements located at the frontage of the property on the Belvedere Avenue and Blanding Lane right of way for the property located at **1 Blanding Lane**.

MOVED BY: Marsha Lasky, seconded by Pat Carapiet.

VOTE: AYES: Peter Mark, Larry Stoehr, Marsha Lasky, Nena Hart, Pat Carapiet, Claire Slaymaker.

NOES: None
ABSTAIN: None
RECUSED: None
ABSENT: Jim Lynch

4. Design Review, Exception to Total Floor Area, and Variance for a remodel and alteration of a single-story residence located at **4 Windward Road**. The project includes re-facing the exterior of the home, a new metal roof and new landscaping. Property Owner: Paul H. Stephens and Eleanor M. Stephens Family Trust; Applicant: Sean Bailey

MOTION: To continue Item 4 (**4 Windward Road**) at the applicant's request, to the next regular Planning Commission meeting.

MOVED BY: Marsha Lasky, seconded by Pat Carapiet.

VOTE: AYES: Peter Mark, Larry Stoehr, Marsha Lasky, Nena Hart, Pat Carapiet, Claire Slaymaker.
NOES: None
ABSTAIN: None
RECUSED: None
ABSENT: Jim Lynch

5. Demolition, Design Review, Variance and Revocable License applications for the demolition of the existing 2,169 SF house and carport and the construction of a new a 3,435 SF two-story home and attached garage located at **57 Peninsula Road**. Property Owner: John and Renee Coker; Applicant: Holscher Architecture.

Associate Planner Markwick presented the staff report. A slide show presentation accompanied her remarks.³ Late correspondence that was received after the issuance of the staff reports had been provided to the Commissioners at the dais.

David Holscher, Holscher Architecture, presented the project. A slide show accompanied his remarks.⁴ He cited the consulting architect's report which was supportive of the merits of the project in relation to the site and the neighborhood. He described the evolution of the design process and many adjustments that have been made to be considerate of neighbors. They believe the project is appropriate in scale and location for a FEMA house in the neighborhood.

Phoebe Holscher, project architect, further described the communications with neighbors during the development of the plans and addressed some of the comments from recent neighbor correspondence.

Commissioners asked questions to clarify details of the project including: the dining room overhang, glazing materials for certain windows, the color scheme, and the encroachment of the front corner of the house into the front setback. Ms. Holscher described proposed hedges planned to improve privacy in the yard at the hot tub location. She indicated that the location of the bulkhead will be at the water line and the stairs to the lagoon will be deleted. She also indicated that modifications to the green roof are being considered to reduce roof structure/height, details of the proposed lighting will be provided, the ceiling height of the garage is 11' to provide storage and there will be a retractable glass wall at the corner.

Open public hearing.

John Coker, property owner, requested approval of this project that has been in development for quite a long time.

³ The staff presentation is archived with the record of the meeting.

⁴ The applicants slide show presentation is archived with the record of the meeting.

Riley Hurd, representing the owner of 55 Peninsula Road, requested that the reduction of the 18 foot tall dining room structure and the high expanses of glass are two areas that could use modification because they have the greatest impact on his client. He requested that a continuance of the project application would allow for direction to be given by the Planning Commission for revisions. He requested that there be new story poles to demonstrate these modifications.

Michael Rex, consulting architect representing the neighbor at 55 Peninsula Road, presented a slide show⁵ to accompany his remarks. He suggested some possible changes including ceiling height reductions and room resizing that would lessen the height and mass of the entire building, which, in a FEMA home, is more impactful. He also indicated the glazing is excessive and should be reduced. He requested a continuance.

Tom Cromwell, 59 Peninsula Road, stated that he has been active on City committees to try and address the FEMA issues, so he understands the dilemma for his neighbors. He presented some slides⁶ of the story poles as seen from his property. The right of his neighbors to rebuild their home is understood, but this design is not harmonious with other structures at this Lagoon location. He appreciates some efforts that were made to reduce some of the issues but not all have yet been addressed. Continued discussions regarding changes to glazing, a too-close air conditioning unit, the overall size especially of the second story, including the added height of the green roof, and other issues. He hopes that they can work together with the architect to further improve the project.

Maureen Johnson, Leeward Road, lives across the Lagoon from this project. Lighting and reflection issues from the large glass areas will impact her property. The Design Review findings discourage large expanses of one material.

Ken Johnson, Leeward Road, is also concerned about the proposed color which will be very bright and reflective. The applicants need to review the amount of glazing and lighting for impacts on neighbors across the water.

Dan Price, 53 Peninsula Road, says the house has a “big box” look which is not in keeping with the homes on the Lagoon. The story poles indicate that there will impacts on his view of Mt. Tamalpais.

Mr. Cromwell added that the proposed fire pit and hot tub should be relocated to the middle of the property.

Ms. Holscher responded. They believe the building is pulled back enough already as it will be in line with the neighbor at 55 Peninsula Road. The suggested reduction of room sizes, hallways, and common rooms are too large to allow for functional use of the home. They would be able to reduce the rear overhang and add a shallow steel structure for shade and can work on reduction of the overall height and the green roof.

Close public hearing.

Commissioners discussed the project extensively. They had all visited the project site and most had also visited the neighbor’s homes. They agreed that although the home is very well designed it is not right for this site as currently designed. They understand and recognize the impacts of the FEMA regulations in this zone are significant so the applicants will need to look at every way to reduce height and mass. Reduction or elimination of the green roof, lowering the garage

⁵ The speaker’s slide show presentation is archived with the record of the meeting.

⁶ The speaker’s slide show presentation is archived with the record of the meeting.

and the bedroom ceiling heights, deletion and reduction of windows especially at the rear of the house, where possible, will improve the project. A consideration of change from flat, to pitched, roof style would reduce mass. Relocation or elimination of the hot tub and deck might be studied. More communication with neighbors is needed.

None of the Commissioners could make the findings for Design Review. Commissioners agreed they could accept the front yard variance for the garage but not for the portion of the house in the setback. They asked the applicants if they would accept a motion of continuance, and they agreed.

MOTION: To continue Item 5 (**57 Peninsula Road**) at the applicant's request, to the next regular Planning Commission meeting.

MOVED BY: Marsha Lasky seconded by Nena Hart.

VOTE: AYES: Peter Mark, Larry Stoehr, Marsha Lasky, Nena Hart, Pat Carapiet, Claire Slaymaker.
NOES: None
ABSTAIN: None
RECUSED: None
ABSENT: Jim Lynch

Director Borba stated that Item 6 is to be continued to the next meeting.

6. Consideration of a Resolution recommending **City Council adoption of an Ordinance amendment to Belvedere Municipal Code Title 20, "Architectural and Environmental Design Review,"** Section 20.04.050 Effect of Noncompliance.

MOTION: To continue Item 6 (**Title 20 Amendment**) to the next regular Planning Commission meeting.

MOVED BY: Pat Carapiet, seconded by Claire Slaymaker.

VOTE: AYES: Peter Mark, Larry Stoehr, Marsha Lasky, Nena Hart, Pat Carapiet, Claire Slaymaker.
NOES: None
ABSTAIN: None
RECUSED: None
ABSENT: Jim Lynch

OTHER SCHEDULED ITEMS

7. Appointment of Chair & Vice Chair.

MOTION: To appoint Peter Mark as Chair of the Planning Commission.

MOVED BY: Marsha Lasky seconded by Nena Hart.

VOTE: AYES: Peter Mark, Larry Stoehr, Marsha Lasky, Nena Hart, Pat Carapiet, Claire Slaymaker.
NOES: None
ABSTAIN: None
RECUSED: None
ABSENT: Jim Lynch

MOTION: To appoint Pat Carapiet as Vice Chair of the Planning Commission.

MOVED BY: Nena Hart, seconded by Marsha Lasky.

VOTE:

AYES:	Peter Mark, Larry Stoehr, Marsha Lasky, Nena Hart, Pat Carapiet, Claire Slaymaker.
NOES:	None
ABSTAIN:	None
RECUSED:	None
ABSENT:	Jim Lynch

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 8:50 pm.

PASSED AND APPROVED at a regular meeting of the Belvedere Planning Commission on April 21, 2020 by the following vote:

AYES:	Peter Mark, Pat Carapiet, Nena Hart, Marsha Lasky, Larry Stoehr, Claire Slaymaker
NOES:	None
ABSTAIN:	Jim Lynch (due to absence from this meeting)
RECUSED:	None
ABSENT:	None

APPROVED: _____
Peter Mark, Planning Commission Chair

ATTEST: _____
Christina Cook, City Clerk