

To: Mayor and City Council

From: Irene Borba, Director of Planning and Building

Subject: **Consider recommendations by the Belvedere Historic Preservation Committee and the Planning Commission to designate 172 Beach Road a City of Belvedere Historic Property, pursuant to Title 21 of the Belvedere Municipal Code**

Recommended Motion/Item Description

1. That the City Council conduct the public hearing; and
2. That the City Council adopt the resolution approving the designation of the property at 172 Beach Road as a City of Belvedere Historic Property.

Background

The applicants and property owners, John Stuart Ryan & Sarah Wright Ryan, have requested that their home at 172 Beach Road receive the City’s designation of Historic Property, pursuant to Title 21 of the Belvedere Municipal Code.

On January 8, 2019, the Belvedere Historic Preservation Committee voted to recommend designation of the home at 172 Beach Road as a City of Belvedere Historically Designated Property.

At the February 19, 2019, Planning Commission meeting, the Commission considered the recommendation of the Historic Preservation Committee, and the material prepared by the Committee as the basis for the recommendation. The Planning Commission approved a motion recommending that the City Council designate the residence at 172 Beach Road as a City of Belvedere Historic Property.

Analysis

Under Chapter 21.20 of the Belvedere Municipal Code, a property owner may initiate the process to apply for the Historical Designation of his or her home. After a complete application is received, the Historical Preservation Committee holds a public hearing to consider the Historical Designation application and makes a recommendation to the Planning Commission. Subsequently, the Planning Commission reviews the application and makes its recommendation to the City Council. Only the City Council can designate a residence as a Belvedere Historically Designated Property.

The house was built and owned c. 1892 by Captain & Mrs. H. N. Cooke. Details that remain unchanged from the first decade include the rounded bays of the two front bedrooms; the columns between the library and dining room; the diagonal wainscoting and built-in cabinets in the dining room; the unusual spool wainscoting in the living room and the ceiling in the library.

The house was acquired by Louis Levison in 1902 & stayed in the family for almost 80 years. In 1910 the Levisons added the master bedroom, adjacent sunroom, and master bath.

In 1981, Walter Scott Newhall purchased the property. In 1982, Mr. Newhall restored and remodeled much of the house. Changes included enlarging the kitchen by incorporating the pantry and outside porch, adding French doors as access to the deck, and creating a new landscaping plan enclosed by a fence and front gate.

In September 1985, Santiago & Alicia Matheus purchased the home from W. Scott Newhall and in December 1986, Mrs. Susan L. Bently purchased the home from Santiago & Alicia Matheus. William D. & Mary E. Corbett purchased the house from Mrs. Bently in November 2003 and most recently the property was purchased in 2011 by J. Stuart & Sarah W. Ryan.

Pursuant to Title 21 of the Belvedere Municipal Code, the Landmarks Preservation Ordinance lists the following criteria for designation of a structure as a landmark:

1. Architecture (*Outstanding example of particular style*).

It is an excellent example of various elements of Queen Anne style of architecture combining features of another late nineteenth century architecture fashion known as shingle style. Included are rounded bays of the two front bedrooms, wood shingles shaped into various patterns and designs, classical columns in the front portico, and horizontal bands of leaded windows. Original construction of the home consisted of rough grade redwood. (Photos attached)

2. Architecture (*Outstanding because of age*).

It was built in 1892; the first wave of Belvedere's building history.

3. Architecture (*It is outstanding because it is the work of a significant architect or builder*).

Not applicable.

4. Architecture (*It is outstanding because it is the first, last, only or most significant architectural property of its type in the city*).

Not applicable.

5. Design (*It has unique design elements & demonstrates outstanding craftsmanship*).

Interior elements of outstanding craftsmanship include the unique bannister, the diagonal wainscoting & built –in cabinets in the dining room and the unusual spool wainscoting in the living room. These elements remain from the original construction. Exterior elements of outstanding craftsmanship consist of varied shingle patterns and leaded windows.

6. History (*It is associated with a person, group or event significant to the city, state or nation, or shows broad cultural, political, social or economic patterns, or embodies and expresses the history of that city*).

The home is constructed in the character of the neighborhood. The stretch of Beach Road adjacent to Belvedere Cove is lined with historical homes during the 1890s and early 1900s. The homes are nestled close to each other and provide a unique visual landmark from both the street and the water.

7. Environment *It contributes to the character of the street or neighborhood area or has significance as a visual landmark owing to its unique location.*

It contributes to the character of the street or neighborhood or has significance as described above in the history (#6).

8. Integrity *It retains most of its original materials and design features.*

The basic house retains most of its original design features. Even subsequent additions are consistent with the original design.

9. National Register of Historic Places: *It is a site or structure listed on the National Register of Historic Places.*

Not applicable.

A structure and site being proposed for historic designation must satisfy at least three of the above-listed criteria. As discussed in detail on the attached survey form, the property at 172 Beach Road satisfies criteria 1, 2, 5, 6, 7 & 8. Once designated, modifications to an historic property are subject to the regulations of the Historic Preservation Ordinance. Pursuant to Section 21.20.090, the Historic Preservation Committee must review the application and make a recommendation to the Planning Commission on the merits of the application & then the Planning Commission makes a recommendation to the Council. Only the City Council can designate a residence as a Belvedere Historically Designated Property. If designated, the property would become eligible for local and county tax reductions under the Mills Act program.

If designated, the property would become eligible for local and county tax reductions under the Mills Act program. Additionally, once designated, modifications to an historic property are subject to the local Belvedere regulations under the Historic Preservation Ordinance, and the State Secretary of the Interior Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. Finally, a designated historic property will constitute an “historic resource” under CEQA and be subject to additional environmental review and potential developmental constraints.

Recommendation

1. That the City Council conduct the public hearing; and
2. That the City Council adopt the resolution approving the designation of the property at 172 Beach Road as a City of Belvedere Historic Property.

Attachments

- Resolution approving the designation of the property located at 172 Beach Road as a City of Belvedere Historic Property.
- Application for Historic Designation.
- Belvedere Historic Designation Survey Form prepared by subcommittee of the Historic Preservation Committee.

CITY OF BELVEDERE

RESOLUTION NO. 2019-

**A RESOLUTION OF THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF BELVEDERE
DESIGNATING THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 172 BEACH ROAD
A CITY OF BELVEDERE HISTORIC PROPERTY**

WHEREAS, a proper application for Historical Status Designation pursuant to Belvedere Municipal Code Chapter 21.20 for the property located at 172 Beach Road has been submitted; and

WHEREAS, the project has been determined to be categorically exempt from the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Section 15061(b)(3) of the CEQA Guidelines because it can be seen with certainty that the Historical Designation of the property will not cause a significant adverse impact on the environment; and

WHEREAS, a home may be designated as an Historic Belvedere Property if three or more of the following findings of facts per to Belvedere Municipal Code section 21.20.070(A) can be made; and

WHEREAS, the City of Belvedere Historic Preservation Committee made a favorable recommendation to the Planning Commission on the Historical Designation application on January 8, 2019; and

WHEREAS, the Planning Commission held duly a noticed public hearing on the Historical Designation application on February 19, 2019, and approved a motion recommending that the City Council designate the property at 172 Beach Road a City of Belvedere Historic Property; and

WHEREAS, the City Council held a duly noticed public hearing on the Historical Designation application on March 11, 2019; and

WHEREAS, the City Council made the following findings of fact pursuant to Section 21.20.070(A) 1, 2, 5, 6, 7 & 8 of the Belvedere Municipal Code for the property at 172 Beach Road:

1. Architecture (Outstanding example of particular style).

It is an excellent example of various elements of Queen Anne style of architecture combining features of another late nineteenth century architecture fashion known as shingle style. Included are rounded bays of the two front bedrooms, wood shingles shaped into various patterns and designs, classical columns in the front portico, and horizontal bands of leaded windows. Original construction of the home consisted of rough grade redwood. (Photos attached)

2. Architecture (Outstanding because of age).

It was built in 1892; the first wave of Belvedere's building history.

3. Architecture (It is outstanding because it is the work of a significant architect or builder.

Not applicable.

4. Architecture (It is outstanding because it is the first, last, only or most significant architectural property of its type in the city.

Not applicable.

5. Design (It has unique design elements & demonstrates outstanding craftsmanship).

Interior elements of outstanding craftsmanship include the unique bannister, the diagonal wainscoting & built-in cabinets in the dining room and the unusual spool wainscoting in the living room. These elements remain from the original construction. Exterior elements of outstanding craftsmanship consist of varied shingle patterns and leaded windows.

6. History (It is associated with a person, group or event significant to the city, state or nation, or shows broad cultural, political, social or economic patterns, or embodies and expresses the history of that city).

The home is constructed in the character of the neighborhood. The stretch of Beach Road adjacent to Belvedere Cove is lined with historical homes during the 1890s and early 1900s. The homes are nestled close to each other and provide a unique visual landmark from both the street and the water.

7. Environment It contributes to the character of the street or neighborhood area or has significance as a visual landmark owing to its unique location.

It contributes to the character of the street or neighborhood or has significance as described above in the history (#6).

8. Integrity It retains most of its original materials and design features.

The basic house retains most of its original design features. Even subsequent additions are consistent with the original design.

9. National Register of Historic Places: It is a site or structure listed on the National Register of Historic Places.

Not applicable.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the City Council of the City of Belvedere does hereby grant approval of Historical Designation status to the residence located at 172 Beach Road pursuant to the findings stated above and incorporated herein.

PASSED AND ADOPTED at a public hearing of the City Council of the City of Belvedere on _____, by the following vote:

AYES:

NOES:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

APPROVED: _____
Robert McCaskill, Mayor

ATTEST: _____
Alison Foulis, City Clerk

Property/Structure Address: 172 BEACH ROAD,
BELVEDERE, CA 94920

**STATEMENT OF PROPERTY OWNERSHIP,
CERTIFICATION OF APPLICATION, & DESIGNATION OF REPRESENTATIVE**

All property owners must complete this Section.

Street address of subject property: 172 BEACH ROAD, BELVEDERE, CA 94920

Assessor's Parcel No(s). of subject property: 06021301

➤ **Properties Owned by Individuals**

I, _____, state under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that I am the record owner of the above-described subject property.

I have read and understood the provisions of Title 21, "Historic Preservation," of the Belvedere Municipal Code and agree to the terms described therein.

Signed this _____ day of _____, 20____, at Belvedere, California.

Signature _____

➤ **Properties Owned by a Trust, LLC, Corporation, Partnership, or Other Entity**

For properties owned by a trust, please attach the trust document or a certificate of trust, including any attachments thereto. For an LLC, corporation, partnership, or other entity, please attach proof of ownership and certification of the signer's authorization to enter into contracts on behalf of the entity.

I, JOHN STUART RYAN, state under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California that the above-described subject property is owned by a trust, LLC, corporation, partnership, or other entity and that my signature on this application has been authorized by all necessary action required by the LLC, corporation, partnership, or other entity.

I have read and understood the provisions of Title 21, "Historic Preservation," of the Belvedere Municipal Code and agree to the terms described therein.

Signed this 24th day of October, 2018, at Belvedere, California.

Signature J. Stuart Ryan

Signature Sarah Wright Ryan

Title(s) _____

Title(s) _____

Trustee(s) Partners: Limited or General Corporation Other _____

Name of trust, LLC, corporation, or other entity: John Stuart Ryan and Sarah Wright Ryan Family Trust

172 Beach Road, Belvedere, CA 94920

The house was built and owned c. 1892 by Captain and Mrs. H. N. Cooke. Details that remain unchanged from the first decade include the rounded bays of the two front bedrooms; the columns between the library and dining room; the diagonal wainscoting and built the cabinets in the dining room; the unusual spool wainscoting in the living room and the ceiling in the library.

The house was acquired by Louis Levison in 1902 and stayed in the family for almost 80 years. In 1910 the Levisons added the master bedroom, adjacent sunroom and master bath.

In 1981 Walter Scott Newhall purchased the property. In 1982 Mr. Newhall restored and remodeled much of the house. Changes included enlarging the kitchen by incorporating the pantry and outside porch, adding French doors as access to the deck, and creating a new landscaping plan enclosed by a fence and front gate.

Mrs. Susan Bently purchased the house prior to 1988.

William and Mary Corbett purchased the house in November 2003.

In December 2011 J. Stuart and Sarah Ryan purchased the property. The realtor's property description at that time was as follows

"Gated, waterfront, turn-of-the-century classic beauty with fabulous view-side veranda with three separate seating areas, separate guest quarters with full bath & washer/dryer, & pier, boat house & dock. Entry level features the formal living room with fireplace, wood floor & coffered ceiling, & music room, formal dining & kitchen, all adjacent & open to the grand terrace. Top floor comprises the stunning master suite with lavish bath, huge walk-in closet & dressing area, fireplace & wonderful view-side sitting/sun room, two additional bedrooms with window seats & beautiful study with built-in book shelves. Lower level has separate en-suite bedroom. Wonderful outdoor living with the grand terrace, beautiful terraced gardens with small pond, the waterfront and boat dock. Five bedrooms, four and one-half baths."

In 2012 the Ryans carried out extensive renovations including adding a breakfast room and a garden room under the sunroom and also added a new entrance at the front door, interior stairs to the lower level, new stairs to the guest quarters above the garage, deck access to the trash area and a new flagpole.

New foundations and footings were poured to secure the house to the hillside and new steel moment frames were inserted into the structure to enhance the shear strength of walls to protect the home from seismic activity.

The lot size is approximated 9,100 sq ft.



CITY OF BELVEDERE

BELVEDERE HISTORIC DESIGNATION SURVEY FORM

The following criteria shall be used when considering structures or sites for historic designation:

1. Architecture It is an outstanding example of a particular style, construction method or material.
2. Architecture It is outstanding because of age.
3. Architecture It is outstanding because it is the work of a significant architect or builder.
4. Architecture It is outstanding because it is the first, last, only or most significant architectural property of its type in the city.
5. Design It has a unique or original design or demonstrates outstanding craftsmanship.
6. History It is associated with a person, group or event significant to the city, state or nation, or shows broad cultural, political, social or economic patterns, or embodies and expresses the history of the city
7. Environment It contributes to the character of the street or neighborhood area or has significance as a visual landmark owing to its unique location.
8. Integrity It retains most of its original materials and design features.
9. National Register of Historic Places It is a site or structure listed on the National Register of Historic Places.



Street Address: 172 Beach Road

Assessor's Parcel Number: 060-213-01

Historic Name of Property: Cooke House

Owner: John Stuart Ryan & Sarah Wright Ryan Family Trust

Owner's Address: 172 Beach Road, Belvedere, CA 94920

Description/Property Chronology:

The house was built & owned c. 1892 by Captain & Mrs. H. N. Cooke. Details that remain unchanged from the first decade include the rounded bays of the two front bedrooms; the columns between the library & dining room; the diagonal wainscoting & built-in cabinets in the dining room; the unusual pool wainscoting in the living room and the ceiling in the library.

The house was acquired by Louis Levison in 1902 & stayed in the family for almost 80 years. In 1910 the Levisons added the master bedroom, adjacent sunroom and master bath.

In 1981, Walter Scott Newhall purchased the property. In 1982 Mr. Newhall restored and remodeled much of the house. Changes included enlarging the kitchen by incorporating the pantry & outside porch, adding French doors as access to the deck, and creating a new landscaping plan enclosed by a fence and front gate.

In September 1985 Santiago & Alicia Matheus purchased the home from W. Scott Newhall and in December 1986 Mrs. Susan L. Bently purchased the home from Santiago & Alicia Matheus.

William D. & Mary E. Corbett purchased the house from Mrs. Bently in November 2003 and most recently the property was purchased in 2011 by J. Stuart & Sarah W. Ryan.

SIGNIFICANCE AND EVALUATION

The property at 172 Beach Road, known as the Cooke House, meets the following criteria for Historic Designation:

1. Architecture: *It is an outstanding example of a particular style, construction method or material.*

It is an excellent example of various elements of Queen Anne style of architecture combining features of another late nineteenth century architecture fashion known as shingle style. Included are rounded bays of the two front bedrooms, wood shingles shaped into various patterns and designs, classical columns in the front portico, and horizontal bands of leaded windows. Original construction of the home consisted of rough grade redwood. (Photos attached)

2. Architecture: *It is outstanding because of age.*

It was built in 1892; the first wave of Belvedere's building history.

3. Architecture: *It is outstanding because it is the work of a significant architect or builder.*

Not applicable.

4. Architecture: *It is outstanding because it is the first, last, only or most significant architectural property of its type in the city.*

Not applicable.

5. Design: *It has a unique or original design or demonstrates outstanding craftsmanship*

Interior elements of outstanding craftsmanship include the unique bannister, the diagonal wainscoting & built-in cabinets in the dining room and the unusual spool wainscoting in the living room. These elements remain from the original construction. Exterior elements of outstanding craftsmanship consist of varied shingle patterns and leaded windows.

6. History: *It is associated with a person, group or event significant to the city, state or nation, or shows broad cultural, political, social or economic patterns, or embodies and expresses the history of the city.*

The home is constructed in the character of the neighborhood. The stretch of Beach Road adjacent to Belvedere Cove is lined with historical homes during the 1890s and early 1900s. The homes are nestled close to each other and provide a unique visual landmark from both the street and the water.

7. Environment: *It contributes to the character of the street or neighborhood area or has significance as a visual landmark owing to its unique location.*

It contributes to the character of the street or neighborhood or has significance as described above in the history (#6).

8. Integrity: *It retains most of its original materials and design features.*

The basic house retains most of its original design features. Even subsequent additions are consistent with the original design.

9. National Register of Historic Places: *It is a site or structure listed on the National Register of Historic Places.*

Not applicable.

Historical Information:

Construction year: 1892 Significant Builder: N/A

Recommendation:

Date of Survey: November 28, 2018

Prepared by: Mel Owen, Historic Preservation Chair and Committee Member George Gnos

Organization: Historic Preservation Committee, City of Belvedere

REFERENCES

A Pictorial History of Belvedere. 1890-1990. The Landmark Society. Edited by Beverly W. Bastion & Barbara B. Gnos.

Here Today, San Francisco's Architectural Heritage, by The Junior League of San Francisco, 1968, and Glimpses of Belvedere & Tiburon, The Early Days, Volume II, The Landmarks Society, 1978.